

Acacia
Financial Group, Inc.

# New Jersey Lottery Enterprise Valuation Report 

## Report of Acacia Financial Group, Inc as Independent Valuation Service Provider

A valuation report on the New Jersey Lottery Enterprise dated May 11, 2017


# New Jersey Lottery Enterprise Valuation Report 

Report of Acacia Financial Group, Inc as Independent Valuation Service Provider

## Executive Summary - Purpose of Report

Acacia Financial Group, Inc. ("Acacia") has been engaged by the State of New Jersey ("State") to serve as the "independent valuation service provider" (the "Valuation Provider") of the New Jersey Lottery Enterprise in connection with the possible contribution of the Lottery Enterprise to certain State Retirement Systems. In connection with this engagement, we have reviewed the draft "Lottery Enterprise Contribution Act" provided to us by the New Jersey State Treasurer (the "Draft Contribution Act"). The purpose of the Draft Contribution Act is to authorize the contribution (the "Proposed Contribution") of the Lottery Enterprise for a term of 30 years to a common trust fund for the benefit of the Eligible Members of certain State Retirement Systems. Consistent with the Draft Contribution Act, Acacia, as the Valuation Provider has conducted a review and due diligence of the Lottery Enterprise ${ }^{1}$, including its cashflows, operating history, legal structure and projections and issued a report which represents its opinion as to the valuation of the Lottery Enterprise."

As a result of the review and due diligence undertaken by Acacia pertaining to the Lottery Enterprise and based upon the methodologies, considerations, and assumptions described herein, in the professional opinion of Acacia, the Lottery Enterprise has a fair value, in connection with the Proposed Contribution, in the amount of $\$ 13.535$ billion as of June 30, 2017.

Acacia is an independent municipal advisory firm engaged in the business of providing municipal advisory services to governmental entities across the country. Acacia was founded in 2006 and has advised on the issuance of more than $\$ 118$ billion in municipal securities since that time. The shareholders with Acacia average approximately 25 years of experience in municipal finance, having worked with other preeminent financial advisory firms and investment banking firms prior to the creation of Acacia. Acacia is registered as a municipal advisor with the Securities Exchange Commission and the Municipal Securities Rulemaking Board. The professionals with Acacia have worked on numerous transactions in the past that have included privatization efforts including concession payments and other esoteric transactions that have include valuations of non-standard assets.

[^0]
## Lottery Governance Structure and Enabling Legislation

The New Jersey State Lottery ("Lottery") was created pursuant to enactment of the "State Lottery Law" (codified as N.J.S.A. 5:9-1 et seq.) to implement the amendment of the Constitution of New Jersey as approved by the people in the general election of November 1969. Notable provisions of the State Lottery Law, as it currently exists without any amendments contained in the Draft Contribution Act, include: (i) N.J.S.A. 5:9-7(a) which authorizes the State Lottery Commission ("Commission") to promulgates such rules and regulations governing the operation of the Lottery such that it "shall produce the maximum amount of net revenues for State institutions and State aid for education", and (ii) N.J.S.A. 5:9-7(a)(11) which stipulates that no less than $30 \%$ of the total revenues accruing from the sale of lottery tickets shall be dedicated to State institutions and State aid for education.

Under the State Lottery Law, the Division of the State Lottery ("DSL") was created within the Department of the Treasury. The State Lottery Law established, within the DSL, the Commission and the Director of the DSL ("Director"). The Commission is charged, under the State Lottery Law, with the power and the duty to establish rules and regulations regarding the Lottery pertaining to, among other things:

- The type of lottery games conducted;
- The price(s) of tickets and shares in the lottery;
- The number and sizes of the prizes on the winning tickets or shares;
- The manner of selecting the winning tickets or share;
- The manner of payment of prizes;
- The frequency of lottery drawings;
- The types and locations at which tickets can be sold;
- The method to be used in selling tickets;
- The licensing of agents to sell tickets;
- The manner and amount of compensation to be paid to licensed sales agents;
- The apportionment of total Lottery revenues to the payment of prizes and operating expenses of the Lottery such that the at least $30 \%$ of total revenues are transferred for State institutions and State aid for education.

The Director is charged, under the State Lottery Law, with the power and the duty to, among other things:

- Supervise and administer the operations of the Lottery;
- Subject to the approval of the Commission, appoint deputy directors, professional, technical and clerical assistants and employees;
- Act as secretary and executive officer to the Commission;
- In accordance with the State Lottery Law and the rules and regulations of the Commission, license (retail) agents to sell lottery tickets;
- Suspend or revoke agent licenses pursuant to the State Lottery Law and the rules and regulations of the Commission;
- Confer regularly with the Commission and make available books, records, files and other information of the DSL;
- Subject to the approval of the Commission, act on purchases of goods and services required in the operation of the Lottery;
- Certify on a monthly basis to the State Treasurer and the Commission a full and complete statement of the Lottery revenues, prize disbursements and other expenses of the preceding months.


## Discussion of Lottery Enterprise Operations

## Revenue Sources

The Lottery Enterprise generates revenue almost exclusively from three sources: the sale of tickets for draw or online games ("Draw Games"), the sale of tickets for instant or "scratch-off" games ("Instant Games"), and forfeited prizes for unclaimed winning tickets older than one year. The sales of tickets represent the vast preponderance of the generated revenue. For context, in State fiscal year 2016 actual (2016A), ticket sales for Draw Games and Instant Games generated nearly $\$ 3.3$ billion and forfeited prizes totaled approximately $\$ 33$ million.

## Existing Games

Draw Games
The Lottery includes eight (8) Draw Games: Pick 3, Pick 4, Jersey Cash 5, 5 Card Cash, Pick 6 Lotto, Mega Millions, CASH4LIFE and Powerball. The draws for these games take place every day (once or twice a day) or two (2) times per week, depending on the game. A summary of each the Draw Games is detailed below.


Pick-3 is a 3 digit Draw Game drawn twice per day. It began on May 22, 1975. Ways to win, from highest payout to lowest are:

- Straight - Matching all three digits exactly as they are drawn
- Wheel - Match all three digits in any order (min. play is $\$ 1.50$ )
- Box - Match all three digits in any order (min. play is $\$ 0.50$ )
- Pair - Two-digit wager; first and second or second and third match
- Split - Two-digit wager; first and last digit match
Pick-4 is a four-digit Draw Game drawn twice per day. It began on July 9, 1977. Ways
to win, from highest payout to lowest are:


## Instant Games/Fast Play

Since 1975, the DSL has offered Instant Games. Instant Games come with numerous price points, prizes formats and themes. These games are offered at prices ranging from $\$ 1$ up to $\$ 30$. As of April 27,

2017, there are 70 Instant Games that are active for purchase at participating New Jersey Lottery locations. Of these 70 Instant Games, there are eight (8) \$1 games, eighteen (18) \$2 games, eight (8) \$3 games, nineteen (19) $\$ 5$ dollar games, eleven (11) $\$ 10$ games, four (4) $\$ 20$ games and two (2) $\$ 30$ games. In 2015, the DSL released a series of games called "Fast Play". These are Instant Games as well, but are generated by the Lottery terminal. These games also vary in price ranging from $\$ 1$ through $\$ 10$. As of April 27, 2017, there are twenty-five (25) Fast Play games that are active in the marketplace. Of these twenty-five games, there are eight (8) $\$ 1$ games, six (6) $\$ 2$ games, five (5) $\$ 3$ games, four (4) $\$ 5$ games and two (2) $\$ 10$ games.

Shown below in Table 1 is the history for the past five years of the sales revenue for various Draw Games and aggregate Instant Games:

Table 1 - Historic Sales Revenue by Game

| SALES REVENUE BY GAME 2012-2016 |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 2012 | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 |
|  | Sales | Sales | Sales | Sales | Sales |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Pick 3 | 431,483,145 | 434,042,304 | 436,742,690 | 437,774,537 | 439,627,708 |
| Pick 4 | 261,758,786 | 266,142,981 | 268,396,396 | 271,765,815 | 275,200,494 |
| Jersey Cash 5 | 142,219,274 | 144,392,456 | 148,226,709 | 148,424,382 | 151,636,143 |
| Pick 6 Lotto | 84,151,564 | 65,323,206 | 77,529,761 | 57,613,947 | 54,632,415 |
| Cash 4 Life |  |  | 4,727,306 | 71,417,890 | 45,760,158 |
| Mega Millions | 238,194,873 | 136,832,941 | 205,860,905 | 162,460,731 | 144,424,092 |
| Powerball | 183,892,771 | 300,381,206 | 233,653,931 | 165,435,126 | 286,003,472 |
| Fastplay |  |  |  |  | 48,388,770 |
| 5 Card Cash |  |  |  |  | 3,064,919 |
| Monopoly Millionaires Club |  |  |  | 3,265,580 |  |
| Raffle Sales |  |  | 1,227,770 |  |  |
| Instant | 1,417,664,313 | 1,474,285,065 | 1,531,771,568 | 1,709,143,246 | 1,872,915,471 |
| Sales Discounts/Tickets Provided as Prizes | $(474,941)$ | - | $(6,491,474)$ | $(26,772,618)$ | $(31,806,927)$ |
| Total Ticket Sales | 2,758,899,785.00 | 2,821,400,159 | 2,901,645,562 | 3,000,528,636 | 3,289,846,715 |

The individual Draw Games have seen fluctuation in their sales revenue over the past five years, particularly with the large jackpot games (Mega Millions and Powerball), driven by the strong increase in play accompanying very large winning jackpots (>\$250M). However, taken in aggregate, the Draws Games (excluding Cash 4 Life which originated during such period) have shown a mild $\mathbf{0 . 4 \%}$ average annual growth over this period with high and low growth of $8.7 \%$ and $-9.3 \%$. Instant Games have shown more constant and stronger growth of $\mathbf{6 . 8 \%}$ average annual growth over this period with high and low growth of $10.3 \%$ and $3.5 \%$. Overall, Draw Games and Instant Games combined have shown steady growth of $4.5 \%$ average annual growth in revenue over this period with high and low growth of $9.6 \%$ and $2.3 \%$.

## Proposed Monitor "Quick Draw" Game (Keno Style Game)

The DSL is planning to introduce a new game to the market called "Quick Draw," a keno style game. This new game will employ the same features as the Lottery's other draw games. The main difference between the two is that Quick Draw will feature drawings every five minutes as opposed to once or twice per day or per week. Players will select their own numbers or choose an option called "Quick Pick" and the Lottery's random number generator will reveal the winning numbers. Winning numbers will be displayed on a television monitor that will be in place where tickets are sold. This game will be most commonly played in social settings such as bars and restaurants to attract new participants to the Lottery. Quick Draw is anticipated to launch in New Jersey during the summer of 2017.

## Operational Expenses

The expenses of the DSL include prize expenses (payout of Lottery winnings) and operational expense of the DSL, of which prize expense represent the vast majority ( $\sim 87 \%$ ).

Table 2 - Historic Lottery Expenses (not including Northstar Incentive Compensation)

| LOTTERY EXPENSES (2012-2016) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Operating Expenses |  | 2012 Expenses | 2013 Expenses | 2014 Expenses | 2015 Expenses | 2016 Expenses |
| Prize Expenses |  | 1,617,771,751 | 1,670,394,764 | 1,731,959,514 | 1,825,233,183 | 2,001,693,206 |
| Retailer commissions |  | 153,657,527 | 157,880,945 | 162,107,574 | 169,445,854 | 185,980,265 |
| Instant ticket vendor printing fees |  | 16,739,981 | 18,140,608 | 18,706,070 | 22,316,078 | 24,467,215 |
| Gaming system vendor fees |  | 20,273,146 | 17,398,700 | 27,220,623 | 31,786,934 | 35,080,631 |
| Northstar NJ management fee |  | - | - | 3,552,740 | 4,850,004 | 4,952,335 |
| Northstar NJ manager expenses |  | - | - | 9,383,269 | 14,186,014 | 13,979,117 |
| Northstar NJ advertising \& marketing expenses |  | - | - | 16,331,995 | 23,320,008 | 24,779,320 |
| Administration expenses |  | 36,595,216 | 35,276,475 | 15,877,577 | 9,967,207 | 10,134,156 |
| Multi-State fees |  | 33,773 | 14,751 | 65,122 | 81,538 | 61,239 |
| Drawing broadcast fees |  | 30,702 | 126,906 | 5,980 | 334,957 | 407,093 |
| Bad debt expense |  | - | - | 400,000 | 625,000 | 110,000 |
| Total Operating Expenses |  | \$1,845,102,096 | \$1,899,233,149 | \$1,985,610,464 | \$2,102,146,777 | \$2,301,644,577 |

There are certain trends in operational expenses to identify as they pertain to assumptions of future expenses as discussed:

- Prize Expenses are directly tied to Lottery sales. Historically, the ratio of Prize Expenses to Sales (payout ratio) is very close to $60 \%$ with the payout ratio for most and the largest of the Draw Games very close to $50 \%$ and for the Instant Games very close to $67 \%$. It is reasonable to assume this payout ratio to remain very close to these values in light of the statutory requirement that $30 \%$ of gross revenues be used as permitted under the Constitution for State institutions and State aid for education.
- Retailer Commissions are directly tied to Lottery sales. Historically, the ratio of Retailer Commissions to Sales is very close to $5.6 \%$.
- The change in year-over-year values of the remaining expenses are relatively de minimis and, with respect to administrative and management expenses, are affected by the commencement of the Northstar contract (discussed in the subsequent section).


## Discussion of Northstar Services Contract

In 2014, the State executed a 15-year Lottery Growth Management Agreement (the "Northstar Service Contract") with Northstar New Jersey Lottery Group, LLC ("Northstar"). Under the Northstar Service Contract, the DSL, while continuing to conduct and maintain oversight and control of the Lottery, has engaged Northstar (i) to provide certain services to the DSL and (ii) to increase sales and net income from the Lottery in order to increase funds for State institutions and State aid to education while maintaining the highest levels of integrity and responsibility.

Briefly, under the Northstar Service Contract, the DSL has engaged Northstar to provide the following listed functions and responsibilities while the DSL has maintained the following listed operations and responsibilities:

## Northstar Services:

- The maintenance and updating of the Lottery Enterprise's "Central Gaming System" including hardware and software;
- The provision of necessary data reports;
- The hosting and maintenance of Lottery websites and social media;
- The installation, maintenance and updating of retail hardware and peripherals;
- The installation, maintenance and updating of vending machines for instant games;
- The development of design, format, payout, pricing of existing and new Lottery games;
- The maintenance, warehousing, distribution and inventory management of instant games tickets (with existing contractors);
- The recruitment, training and supervision of Lottery retailers;
- The management of customer relations;
- The revocation, suspension and removal of equipment for suspended Lottery retailers;
- The retrieval, reconciliation and return of Lottery retailer instant game tickets at game end;
- The procedures, design and prizes related to second chance draws;
- The design, implementation, and funding of marketing, advertising, public relations, promotional campaigns, branding and loyalty campaigns;
- The creation of general marketing strategy;
- The support and facilitation of daily broadcast of Lottery drawings on established mediums;
- The operation of Lottery call centers;
- The development, operation and maintenance of responsible gambling program;
- The engagement and contracting of subcontractors to provide these services;
- The maintenance and monitoring of compliance with regulatory requirements, State policies and rules;
- The protection of State intellectual property;
- The provision of services relating to new multi-state lottery games

DSL Retained Operational Responsibilities:

- The validation of winning Lottery tickets;
- The setting and payment of jackpot prizes;
- The management and broadcast of primary Lottery drawings;
- The control of collections from Lottery retailers and transfer of funds to the State;
- The licensing of Lottery retailers;
- Tax reporting for prizes and Lottery retailers;
- Fraud investigations, audits and financial reporting;
- Obtaining approvals from the Lottery Commission

Northstar is compensated under the Northstar Service Contract (i) for reimbursement of Operating Expenses which generally means Northstar direct employee salaries and benefits, Northstar overhead for business operations, and subcontractor expenses for goods and services in support of the Lottery operations and (ii) based upon the Net Income generated by the Lottery (the "Incentive Compensation") during the Northstar Service Contract. The amount of the Incentive Compensation is based upon formulaic calculations of the differences in the amount of Net Income generated relative to various static benchmark and baseline net income levels specified for each of the State fiscal years of the Northstar Service Contract. The net effect of these formulaic calculations is generally (a) to permit the sharing of Net Income between the DSL and Northstar under circumstances where Net Income exceeds certain thresholds but in no event may Northstar receive more than 5\% of the Net Income, and (b) to require that Northstar make payments to the DSL for a portion of the amount, when occurring, by which Net Income lags certain thresholds². This results in the following effects or potential benefits to the DSL:

- Northstar is incentivized, by the nature of the Incentive Compensation, to maximize the Net Income to which the DSL shares in the benefit.

[^1]- The DSL is partially insulated from reduced Net Income as a result of downturns in Lottery game participation whether as a function of economic conditions or player interests.
- The DSL is the beneficiary of unique skills brought by Northstar to maximize Net Income.

The effect to the DSL of the Northstar Service Contract is that expected Net Income to the DSL is moderately "corralled" under scenarios of more or less Lottery sales than projected. It should be noted that the financial projections for the Lottery as prepared by Northstar (without including the projected effects of the Quick Draw game) are identical to the "Net Income Targets" as defined in the Northstar Service Contract which are the values in each contract year against which a portion of the Incentive Compensation is determined. This means that deviations in future Net Income will be buffered, during the term of the Northstar Service Contract, from the effects of deviations in the future Lottery sales. This further supports the conclusion that the projections of future Net Income (discussed below) are reasonable to rely upon.

The Northstar Service Contract has a scheduled Termination Date (notwithstanding various provisions for convenience termination and termination for cause) of June 30, 2029. There are no extension options by either party under the contract.

## Discussion of Lottery Enterprise Financial Projections

Acacia has been provided by the DSL with estimated financial projections (attached as Exhibit A) of the Lottery Enterprise for the period of State fiscal years 2018 through 2029 (the "Front-End Projection Period"). Northstar first provided financial projections in connection with the submission of its bid to provide services to the DSL as enumerated above, with the exception for the inclusion of projected revenues and expenses (mostly payout) associated with the forthcoming Quick Draw game. Northstar's initial financial projections were revised by Amendments 1 and 2 to the Northstar Services Contract due to changed circumstances. The financial projections in Exhibit A are consistent with those in Amendment 2.

Within Operating Revenues, these projections notably include estimates for the revenue generated by the respective existing Draw Games and Instant Games (as discussed above) and for the forthcoming Quick Draw game. It should be noted that, to provide for an anticipated effect of Quick Draw upon the existing Draw Games and Instant Games, the sales for all other Draw Games and Instant Games have been projected to be reduced, in aggregate, by an amount equal to $15 \%$ of the projected sales revenue from Quick Draw. Also included, but less significant in size, are revenues including forfeited prizes and miscellaneous revenues.

Within Operating Expenses are prize expenses (representing the largest expense component), retailer expenses, subcontractor vending and printing expenses, Northstar management fees and DSL
administrative and operating expenses. Further, Northstar's Incentive Compensation is included as a function of the formulaic requirements of the Northstar Service Contract.

The resulting projected Net Income represents the projected funds available for purposes under the Draft Contribution Act.

Listed below are a number of the particular material line items that are not simply being (a) escalated at an assumed inflation rate or (b) calculated based upon Commission directed rules (e.g. prize expense payout percentages by game) or formulaic calculations (e.g. Northstar Incentive Compensation) during the Front-End Projection Period:

- Mega Millions Ticket Sales - Mega Million sales are projected to grow from 2018E through 2029E in a non-uniform fashion by year-over-year increments ranging from zero to $\$ 25$ million. The Northstar rationale for the nature of these increases is based upon intermittent (e.g. very few years) modifications to this multi-state game which are expected to result in increased sales (similar to past practices). It should be noted that Mega Millions (and Powerball) sales amounts, as multi-state games with intermittently very large prizes can fluctuate significantly in annual revenue (i.e. years with multiple very large prize payout due to rollover of non-winning jackpots can produce significantly more revenue). This is intrinsic to the "long" jackpot winning odds (leading to rollovers) and consequentially the related increased playing demand for large jackpots.
- Powerball Ticket Sales - Powerball sales are projected to grow from 2018E through 2029E in a nonuniform fashion by year-over-year increments ranging from zero to $\$ 25$ million. Similar to the Mega Millions ticket sales, Northstar's rationale for the nature of these increases is based upon intermittent modifications to this multi-state game which results in increased sales.
- Quick Draw Sales - Northstar has provided certain projections of the revenues and expenses expected with the Quick Draw game. As noted above, this is a new game and therefore, no operating history exists. The projections estimate a fully mature game with 1,800 Quick Draw locations by early calendar 2019 yielding mature sales by 2021 of approximately $\$ 220 \mathrm{M}$. Acacia has evaluated these provided projections against other existing "keno" style games at lotteries across the country on a revenue per state population basis (attached as Exhibit B) and finds the Northstar provided projections to be within the ranges of these other state's actual results.
- Northstar Management Expenses - Northstar Management Expenses are projected to rise from $\$ 13.9 \mathrm{M}(2016 \mathrm{~A})$ to $\$ 18.0 \mathrm{M}$ (2017E) to $\$ 25.5 \mathrm{M}$ (2018E) and then grow at $2.8 \%$ per annum thereafter. The Northstar rationale for the nature of these early year increases is a conservative assumption of the maximum amount permissible under the Northstar Service Contract. Actual Northstar Management Expenses are expected to be lower as this amount is "pass-through" amount of actual expenses and adversely impacts the Northstar Incentive Compensation.

In the provided financial projection, during the Front-End Projection Period, overall ticket sales are projected to grow at a moderate $1.7 \%$ compounded annual rate (excluding Quick Draw). This rate is significantly lower than the historic growth rate for all ticket sales in the past five years of $4.5 \%$ and below the lowest growth rate in the past five years of $2.3 \%$. Quick Draw, once mature in 2021, is
projected to grow at an even lower $1.0 \%$ compounded annual rate during the Front-End Projection Period. For purposes of this report, Acacia has escalated the ticket sales, prize expenses and most of the other operating expenses in the period 2030 to 2047 corresponding to the final year of the Contribution (the "Back-End Projection Period") at a 1.0\% annual escalation rate.

Acacia has reviewed the historical audited results of the Lottery Enterprise's revenues and expenses from the past 10 years and engaged in due diligence of these matters with the Director's office and concludes that the provided financial projections and the assumptions contained therein are reasonable. It should be recognized and is noted that the actual results of the revenues and operating expenses of the Lottery Enterprise may, and likely will, differ from these projections.

## Discussion of the Draft Lottery Enterprise Contribution Act

Pursuant to the Draft Contribution Act, this report is anticipated to be used in connection with the contribution of the Lottery Enterprise to a common trust fund, entitled "Common Pension Fund L", to be created and established by the Draft Contribution Act. The Common Pension Fund L shall be for the benefit of Eligible Members of the certain Retirement Systems, specifically the Teachers' Pension and Annuity Fund, the Public Employees Retirement System and the Police and Firemen's Retirement System. Without purporting to provide a full recitation of the Draft Contribution Act or all material issues therein, below is a description of certain aspects of the Draft Contribution Act that Acacia deems relevant to the preparation of this report:

- Under the Draft Contribution Act, the DSL "shall operate, manage, conduct and control the Lottery Enterprise with a goal of maximizing net proceeds for the benefit of the Retirement Systems, consonant with the dignity of the State and the general welfare of the people";
- No material change shall occur to the statutory governance and management of the Lottery Enterprise by the DSL as a result of the Draft Contribution Act;
- The term of the contribution of the Lottery Enterprise shall be for a period of thirty (30) years from the Contribution Date.


## Discussion of Federal Criminal Gambling Statutes

Chapter 61 of Title 18 of the United States Code regulates specifically the transportation, mailing, and broadcasting of lottery tickets and lottery information in interstate commerce. It is Acacia's understanding that the Contribution will not implicate the federal lottery statutes, provided it remains within the "conducted by a State acting under the authority of State law" exemptions. For purposes of qualifying under the "conducted by a State" exemption, it is important that the State of New Jersey maintain actual control and authority over the conduct of the Lottery Enterprise, including daily operating decisions and rights to audit/financial accountability, and that the Lottery itself be authorized by State law.

## Method of Valuation

For the purpose of determining a fair value of the Lottery Enterprise in the Contribution, a number of valuation methodologies were initially considered. These initial methodologies are discussed below.

## Audited Financial Statements Value

The most recent Audited Financial Statement (as of June 30, 2016) place the Net Position (Current Assets plus Deposit Fund Contracts less Current and Non-Current Liabilities) at $\$ 11.4$ million. Acacia does not believe that this is a reasonable proxy for the value of an enterprise, over a thirty-year term, that contributes nearly $\$ 1$ billion per year currently net to the State for its enumerated purposes.

## Market Value (by analogy to other gaming related public companies)

 As another possible valuation methodology, Acacia has compared various publicly traded gaming and gaming technology related companies' "total enterprise value ${ }^{3 \prime}$ (as a proxy for valuation) to "EBITDA" (as a proxy for Net Income for Transfer from the Lottery Enterprise because no debt, taxes or depreciation are applicable to the Lottery). For recent years, the resulting ratios of total enterprise value to EBITDA for the various shown companies range between 3.7 and 21.6 (refer to Exhibit C). Applying these ratios to the Lottery Enterprise's projected 2018E Net income for Transfer of $\$ 1,001 \mathrm{M}$ results in valuation ranges between $\$ 3.7 \mathrm{~B}$ and $\$ 21.6 \mathrm{~B}$. These values are highly disparate. Acacia believes that there is not sufficient correlation in these numbers to make this a meaningful methodology, particularly to discern a singular value.
## Potential Sale Value (analogous to an asset sale or privatization with a concession payment)

As another possible valuation methodology, Acacia has compared various lottery related acquisitions (non-domestic because no US lottery has been sold). The ratio of the transaction value to implied EBITDA is compared (refer to Exhibit D) for those where information is publicly available. Applying these ratios to the Lottery Enterprise's projected 2018E Net income for Transfer of $\$ 1,001 \mathrm{M}$ results in valuation ranges between $\$ 3.6 \mathrm{~B}$ and $\$ 10.3 \mathrm{~B}$.

Acacia has also reviewed various municipal enterprise (e.g. toll roads, parking, energy, etc.) acquisitions. Again, the ratio of the transaction value to implied EBITDA is compared (refer to Exhibit E) for those where information is publicly available. Applying these ratios to the Lottery Enterprise's projected 2018E Net income for Transfer of $\$ 1,001 \mathrm{M}$ results in valuation ranges between $\$ 1.2 \mathrm{~B}$ and \$5.9B.

These results are very limited (based upon scarce public information) and further do not provide a sufficient degree of correlation to extract a singular value for valuation. Moreover, in most if not all of

[^2]the examples, the nature of the business and/or the term of the proposed transaction are not directly analogous to the Lottery Enterprise. It should also be noted that the sale of the Lottery Enterprise to a private entity would not be permissible under Federal criminal statutes, which further diminishes the applicability of this methodology.

## Discounted Cashflow Value

Given the variances in the results in the above methodologies and the simple inapplicability of the Audited Financial Statements Value, the Market Value and the Potential Sale Value methodologies, Acacia believes that a Discounted Cashflow Value methodology is the most applicable and best methodology to apply to the Lottery Enterprise. The Actuarial Standard of Practice No. 44 (ASOP-44) of the Actuarial Standards Board provides:

Assets that are Difficult to Value - Some assets do not have a readily established market value, such as certain insurance contracts, real estate or other property. In determining the value of such assets, if audited financial statements do not provide an appropriate market value, the actuary may consider appraisal by qualified independent experts, recent sales or similar assets, the present value of reasonably expected future cash flows, or other appropriate methods. The value, so determined, may be treated as market value for the purposes of this standard.

ASOP 44 enumerates that, in the absence of audited financial statements, recent sales, or similar assets providing appropriate market value, the present value of reasonably expected future cashflow may be treated as market value under this standard. Acacia believes this conclusion is further supported by:

- The historical actual and predictable future cashflow of the Lottery Enterprise yielding Net Income is more analogous to returns on a fixed income security (e.g. bonds whose value is determined by discounting the future cashflows at market rates) than they are to assets with market driven fluctuations in the value such as equities (e.g. stocks) or real estate.
- The State Constitutional mandate to "produce the maximum amount of net revenues" for "State institutions and State aid for education" (under the State Lottery Law) or "Retirement Systems" (as amended by the Draft Contribution Act) provides the statutory directive for the DSL to maximize Lottery Enterprise performance.
- The Northstar Service Contract provides (a) financial incentive to exceed, and financial disincentive to fail to achieve, the predicted financial projections and (b) a "governor" on the returns to the DSL in circumstances where actual results deviate from projections.

The resulting opinion of fair value herein has been determined by discounting the financial projections provided by the DSL for the Front-End Projection Period and year 2029E values escalated at 1.0\% annually thereafter for the Back-End Projection Period at the discount factor discussed in the below section.

## Discussion on Discount Factors

The discount factor to apply in a discounted cashflow analyses is generally accepted to be a "riskadjusted" discount rate computed by adding to a "risk free" rate, a "risk premium" commensurate with the nature of the asset or investment.

The most commonly accepted proxy for long-term risk free rates are those of US Treasuries. The current yields on the most actively traded long term US Treasuries (10-year tenor and 30-year tenor) are $2.38 \%$ and $3.02 \%$ respectively. The "shape" of the "returns" from the projected Lottery Enterprise cashflows are ascending (based largely on the assumption of inflationary growth) whereas the returns on a Treasury Bond are level (static coupon). Inasmuch, Acacia has calculated the duration of the projected Lottery Enterprise cashflows to be 21.0 years whereas the duration on the current $30-$ Year TBond ( $3.0 \%$ coupon maturing $2 / 15 / 2047$ with current price of $100.656 \%$ ) is 20.2 years. To adjust the risk free rate, Acacia has added 2.5 basis points (representing the marginal 0.8 years between the respective durations times the linearly interpolated difference ${ }^{5}$ between the yield on the 10-Year T-Bond and the 30 -Year T-Bond of 3.2 basis points per year) to the yield on the current 30 year US T-Bond to derive a risk free rate of $3.05 \%$.

A commonly accepted methodology of determining a risk premium is to multiply (a) "beta" (a measure of volatility for a particular asset to the relevant market as a whole) for the nature of the asset or project by (b) market rate of return ("ROR").

Acacia has extracted beta values for a number of significant domestic and foreign gaming/lottery related public companies (refer to Exhibit F). The results of these beta values are in the range of 0.57 to 2.41 (or 0.72 to 1.83 when excluding technology companies) with a market cap weighted average beta of 1.16.

In these circumstances, Acacia believes that the beta should be a smaller number (i.e. ~1.0) than the above market cap weighted average beta given the predictable nature of the Lottery's characteristics:

- The Lottery is intrinsically a monopoly with a sovereign authorization and mandate;
- The Lottery's historic net revenues have shown relatively constant net growth, even in the face of variable returns from Mega Millions and Powerball (eccentric returns due to large jackpot amounts).

To derive a risk premium, Acacia has canvassed the same publicly traded companies utilized in the above beta discussion and extracted return on assets to serve as proxy RORs for lottery related enterprises (refer to Exhibit G).

Utilizing the above described factors results in the following formula:

[^3]Estimated Discount rate = Risk-free ROR + (beta x market ROR)
$$
\text { Estimated Discount rate }=3.05 \%+(1.0 \times 4.61 \%)=7.66 \%
$$

Acacia has rounded this value to the nearest 5 basis points or $7.65 \%$

## Opinion

In connection with this engagement, Acacia has conducted a review of the following documents, reports and data:

- The financial projections as provided by the DSL;
- Audits of the Lottery for the past ten years;
- The Northstar Service Contract (including amendments thereto);
- The State Lottery Law;
- The Contribution Act bill as currently drafted;
- The Memorandum of Contribution as currently drafted;

Acacia has performed due diligence with the DSL on matters including, but not limited to:

- The historic Lottery results;
- The Northstar financial projections discussed in prior sections;
- The performance and quality of work to date by Northstar in their capacity under the Northstar Service Contract;

Acacia has prepared an analysis (attached as Exhibit H) calculating the discounted or present value of (a) the provided projected Net Income of the Lottery Enterprise for the State fiscal years 2018 through and including 2029 and (b) the estimated Net Income of the Lottery Enterprise for the State fiscal years 2030 through and including 2047 (estimated by escalating the respective revenues and most expenses in fiscal year 2029 in (a) above annually by $1.0 \%$ ). Acacia has employed a discount factor of $7.65 \%$ in this calculation.

It should be noted that in rendering the below opinion, Acacia has assumed that:

- The DSL, including the Commission and the Director with DSL staff, diligently pursues the State objective articulated in the State Lottery Law and as amended by the Draft Contribution Act to "operate, manage, conduct and control the Lottery Enterprise with a goal of maximizing net proceeds."
- No existing Draw Game shall be discontinued during the term of the Lottery Enterprise.
- The DSL, and Northstar while engaged, shall create, operate and promote Instant Games consistent with current levels.
- The DSL will protect against and prosecute actions of fraud, theft, and other violations, including cyberattacks, that threaten the integrity and performance of the Lottery with not less than the current level of vigilance or that which may be appropriate in future years.

Acacia is of the opinion that the resulting present value of $\$ 13.535$ billion represents a fair value for the State to employ in connection with the Proposed Contribution as of June 30, 2017. This valuation opinion is applicable solely as of dated date herein.

This report may be relied upon by the State and its appointed professionals in connection with any actions relating to the Draft Contribution Act. No reliance on or other use of this report by any person or for any purpose other than as stated in the previous sentence is permitted.

|  | 2016 |  | 2017 | $\begin{array}{r} 2018 \\ \text { Estimated } \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 2019 \\ \text { Estimated } \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 2020 \\ \text { Estimated } \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 2021 \\ \text { Estimated } \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 2022 \\ \text { Estimated } \end{array}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Actual | Estimated |  |  |  |  |  |
| Operating revenues |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ticket Sales |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Pick 3 | s | 439,627,708 | 446,000,000 | 448,000,000 | 447,500,000 | 446,000,000 | 445,500,000 | 440,000,000 |
| Pick 4 |  | 275,200,494 | 275,000,000 | 275,000,000 | 274,500,000 | 273,500,000 | 273,500,000 | 270,000,000 |
| Jersey Cash 5 |  | 151,636,143 | 154,450,000 | 160,000,000 | 165,000,000 | 170,000,000 | 175,000,000 | 175,000,000 |
| Pick 8 Lotto |  | 54,632,415 | 59,210,000 | 62,000,000 | 62,500,000 | 64,000,000 | 65,500,000 | 65,500,000 |
| Cash 4 Life |  | 45,760,158 | 37,024,000 | 40,000,000 | 45,000,000 | 45,000,000 | 45,000,000 | 45,000,000 |
| Mega Milions |  | 144,424,092 | 154,863,000 | 165,000,000 | 185,000,000 | 202,000,000 | 215,000,000 | 230,000,000 |
| Powerball |  | 286,003,472 | 185,657,000 | 200,000,000 | 220,000,000 | 240,000,000 | 260,000,000 | 280,000,000 |
| Fastplay |  | 48,388,770 | 41,652,000 | 50,000,000 | 55,000,000 | 57,000,000 | 60,000,000 | 60,000,000 |
| Niche Games (5 Card Cash) |  | 3,064,919 | 32,396,000 | 37,000,000 | 41,000,000 | 46,000,000 | 52,000,000 | 55,000,000 |
| NEW PRODUCTS |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Instant |  | 1,872,915,471 | 1,858,088,300 | 1,882,900,000 | 1,876,750,000 | 1,875,500,000 | 1,875,000,000 | 1,875,000,000 |
| Less Sales Discounts/Tickets Provided as Prizes |  | $(31,806,927)$ | (36,673,700) | $(35,000,000)$ | $(35,000,000)$ | $(35,000,000)$ | $(35,000,000)$ | $(35,000,000)$ |
| Total Ticket Sales |  | 3,289,846,714 | 3,207,666,600 | 3,284,900,000 | 3,337,250,000 | 3,384,000,000 | 3,431,500,000 | 3,460,500,000 |
| Other revenues |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Forfeited Prizes |  | 33,931,475 | 37,601,250 | 40,000,000 | 40,000,000 | 40,000,000 | 40,000,000 | 40,000,000 |
| Miscellaneous |  | 1,983,565 | 1,500,000 | 1,500,000 | 1,500,000 | 1,500,000 | 1,500,000 | 2,000,000 |
| Total operating revenues |  | 3,325,761,753 | 3,246,767,850 | 3,326,400,000 | 3,378,750,000 | 3,425,500,000 | 3,473,000,000 | 3,502,500,000 |
| Operating expenses |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Prize expenses |  | 2,001,693,206 | 1,965,532,722 | 1,998,618,597 | 2,030,514,707 | 2,059,220,136 | 2,091,007,878 | 2,107,868,695 |
| Retailer commissions |  | 185,980,265 | 181,211,055 | 185,925,340 | 188,888,350 | 191,534,400 | 195,222,900 | 195,864,300 |
| Instant ticket vendor printing fees |  | 24,467,215 | 24,594,354 | 24,665,990 | 24,585,425 | 24,569,050 | 24,562,500 | 24,562,500 |
| Gaming system vendor fees |  | 35,080,631 | 34,160,073 | 35,148,430 | 35,708,575 | 36,208,800 | 36,717,050 | 37,027,350 |
| Northstar NJ management fee |  | 4,952,335 | 5,056,000 | 5,162,000 | 5,270,000 | 5,381,000 | 5,494,000 | 5,609,000 |
| Northstar NJJ manager expenses |  | 13,979,117 | 18,048,000 | 25,457,000 | 26,159,000 | 26,882,000 | 27,627,000 | 28,392,000 |
| Northstar NJ advertising \& marketing expenses |  | 24,779,320 | 26,157,000 | 27,280,000 | 28,371,000 | 29,464,000 | 30,565,000 | 31,674,000 |
| Administration expenses |  | 10,134,156 | 13,271,000 | 13,271,000 | 14,708,307 | 15,076,014 | 15,452,915 | 15,839,238 |
| Mult-State fees |  | 61,239 | 150,000 | 150,000 | 150,000 | 150,000 | 150,000 | 150,000 |
| Drawing broadcast fees |  | 407,093 | 250,000 | 250,000 | 250,000 | 300,000 | 300,000 | 350,000 |
| Bad debt expense |  | 110,000 | 600,000 | 600,000 | 600,000 | 600,000 | 600,000 | 600,000 |
| Total Operating Expenses |  | 2,301,644,578 | 2,269,030,204 | 2,316,528,357 | 2,355,205,364 | 2,389,385,400 | 2,427,699,243 | 2,447,937,083 |
| Operating Income (pre Quick Draw) |  | 1,024,117,175 | 977,737,646 | 1,009,871,643 | 1,023,544,636 | 1,036,114,600 | 1,045,300,757 | 1,054,562,917 |
| Net Income from Quick Draw |  | - | - | 18,722,200 | 45,437,000 | 68,396,300 | 73,419,100 | 74,153,300 |
| Operating Income Inclusive of Quick Draw |  | 1,024,117,175 | 977,737,646 | 1,028,593,843 | 1,068,981,636 | 1,104,510,900 | 1,118,719,857 | 1,128,716,217 |
| Non-operating revenue | 5 | 3,155,103 | 200,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 |
| Income (Loss) Before Transfers |  | 1,027,272,279 | 977,937,646 | 1,028,793,843 | 1,069,181,636 | 1,104,710,900 | 1,118,919,857 | 1,128,916,217 |
| Northstar NJ incentive payment Inclusive of Quick Draw* |  | $(30,623,965)$ | $(15,492,681)$ | $(27,816,969)$ | (31,576,927) | $(33,135,327)$ | $(32,515,271)$ | (29,781,743) |
| Income available for Transfer Inclusive of Quick Draw |  | 996,648,314 | 962,444,965 | 1,000,976,874 | 1,037,604,709 | 1,071,575,573 | 1,086,404,586 | 1,099,134,474 |
|  |  | 2023 | 2024 | 2025 | 2026 | 2027 | 2028 | 2029 |
| Operating revenues |  | Estimated | Estimated | Estimated | Estimated | Estimated | Estimated | Estimated |
| Ticket Sales |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Pick 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Pick 4 |  | 440,000,000 | 440,000,000 | 440,000,000 | 436,000,000 | 436,000,000 | 436,000,000 | 436,000,000 |
| Jersey Cash 5 |  | 270,000,000 | 269,500,000 | 269,000,000 | 265,000,000 | 265,000,000 | 265,000,000 | 265,000,000 |
| Pick 6 Lotto |  | 178,000,000 | 180,000,000 | 190,000,000 | 200,000,000 | 205,000,000 | 210,000,000 | 213,000,000 |
| Cash 4 Life |  | 67,000,000 | 68,500,000 | 69,000,000 | 71,500,000 | 71,500,000 | 72,000,000 | 73,000,000 |
| Mega Millions |  | 45,000,000 | 45,000,000 | 47,000,000 | 50,000,000 | 50,000,000 | 50,000,000 | 50,000,000 |
| Powerball |  | $230,000,000$ | 230,000,000 | 240,000,000 | 255,000,000 | 280,000,000 | 295,000,000 | 300,000,000 |
| Fastplay |  | 295,000,000 | 302,000,000 | 310,000,000 | $310,000,000$ | 310,000,000 | 310,000,000 | 315,000,000 |
| Niche Games (5 Card Cash) |  | 65,000,000 | 68,000,000 | 70,000,000 | 74,000,000 | 77,000,000 | 80,000,000 | 85,000,000 |
| NEW PRODUCTS |  | 60,000,000 | 65,000,000 | 70,000,000 | 75,000,000 | 80,000,000 | 85,000,000 | 90,000,000 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Less Sales Discounts/Tickets Provided as Prizes Total Ticket Sales |  | $\begin{gathered} 1,875,000,000 \\ (35,000,000) \end{gathered}$ | $1,900,000,000$ $(40,000,000)$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1,900,000,000 \\ & (40,000,000) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 1,900,000,000 \\ (40,000,000) \end{gathered}$ | $1,900,000,000$ $(40,000,000)$ | $\begin{array}{r} 1,910,000,000 \\ (40,000,000) \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 1,925,000,000 \\ (40,000,000) \end{array}$ |
|  |  | 3,490,000,000 | 3,528,000,000 | 3,565,000,000 | 3,596,500,000 | 3,634,500,000 | 3,673,000,000 | 3,712,000,000 |
| Other revenues |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Forfeited Prizes |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Miscellaneous |  | $40,000,000$ $2,000,000$ | $\begin{array}{r} 40,000,000 \\ 2,000,000 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 40,000,000 \\ 2,000,000 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 42,000,000 \\ 2,000,000 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 42,000,000 \\ 2,000,000 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 42,000,000 \\ 2,000,000 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 42,000,000 \\ 2,000,000 \end{array}$ |
| Total operating revenues |  | 3,532,000,000 | 3,570,000,000 | 3,607,000,000 | 3,640,500,000 | 3,678,500,000 | 3,717,000,000 |  |
| Operating expenses |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Prize expenses |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Retailer commissions |  | $2,123,574,490$ $197,534,000$ | $2,146,759,564$ $199,684,800$ | 2,169,266,296 | $2,188,466,765$ $203,561,900$ | 2,211,585,960 | $2,234,983,340$ $207,891,800$ | $2,258,653,106$ $210,099,200$ |
| Instant ticket vendor printing fees |  | 24,562,500 | $19,964,800$ $24,990,000$ | 24,890,000 | $203,561,900$ $24,890,000$ | 205,712,00 24,890,00 | $207,891,800$ $25,021,000$ | $210,21,200$ $25,217,500$ |
| Gaming system vendor fees |  | 24,362,500 | 37,749,600 | 38,145,500 | 38,482,550 | 38,889,150 | 39,301,100 | 39,718,400 |
| Northstar NJ management fee |  | 5,727,000 | 5,847,000 | 5,970,000 | 6,095,000 | 6,223,000 | 6,354,000 | 6,488,000 |
| Northstar NJ manager expenses |  | 29,177,000 | 29,987,000 | 30,820,000 | 31,676,000 | 32,557,000 | 33,463,000 | 34,395,000 |
| Northstar NJ advertising \& marketing expenses |  | 32,790,000 | 33,446,000 | 34,115,000 | 34,797,000 | 35,493,000 | 36,203,000 | 36,927,000 |
| Administration expenses |  | 16,235,219 | 16,641,099 | 17,057,127 | 17,483,555 | 17,920,644 | 18,368,660 | 18,827,876 |
| Mult-State fees |  | 150,000 | 150,000 | 150,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 |
| Drawing broadcast fees |  | 350,000 | 400,000 | 400,000 | 400,000 | 450,000 | 450,000 | 450,000 |
| Bad debt expense |  | 650,000 | 650,000 | 650,000 | 650,000 | 675,000 | 675,000 | 675,000 |
| Total Operating Expenses |  | 2,468,093,209 | 2,496,205,063 | 2,523,242,923 | 2,546,702,770 | 2,574,596,454 | 2,602,910,900 | 2,631,651,082 |
| Operating Income (pre Quick Draw) |  | 1,063,906,791 | 1,073,794,937 | 1,083,757,077 | 1,093,797,230 | 1,103,903,546 | 1,114,089,100 | 1,124,348,918 |
| Net Income from Quick Draw <br> Operating Income Inclusive of Quick Draw |  | 74,894,800 | 75,643,700 | 76,400,200 | 77,164,200 | 77,935,800 | 78,715,200 | 79,502,300 |
|  |  | 1,138,801,591 | 1,149,438,637 | 1,160,157,277 | 1,170,961,430 | 1,181,839,346 | 1,192,804,300 | 1,203,851,218 |
| Non-operating revenue |  | 200,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 |
| Income (Loss) Before Transfers |  | 1,139,001,591 | 1,149,638,637 | 1,160,357,277 | 1,171,161,430 | 1,182,039,346 | 1,193,004,300 | 1,204,051,218 |
| Northstar $N J$ incentive payment Inclusive of Quick Draw*Income available for Transfer Inclusive of Quick Draw |  | (27,066,018) | $(24,211,627)$ | $(21,207,355)$ | $(18,137,386)$ | $(14,915,969)$ | (14,312,315) | (14,489,361) |
|  |  | 1,111,935,573 | 1,125,427,010 | 1,139,149,922 | 1,153,024,044 | 1,167,123,377 | 1,178,691,985 | 1,189,561,857 |


| Comparable U.S. States hosting Keno/Keno Style Games as of 2016 |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| State |  | Keno <br> es (x000) | Population | Sales per population |
| California | \$ | 232,286 | 39,250,017 | \$5.92 |
| Connecticut |  | 10,600 | 3,576,452 | \$2.96 |
| Delaware (2015) |  | 7,000 | 952,065 | \$7.35 |
| Georgia |  | 192,900 | 10,310,371 | \$18.71 |
| Kansas |  | 18,155 | 2,907,289 | \$6.24 |
| Kentucky |  | 65,900 | 4,436,974 | \$14.85 |
| Maryland |  | 311,600 | 6,016,447 | \$51.79 |
| Massachusetts |  | 79,388 | 6,811,779 | \$11.65 |
| Michigan |  | 624,119 | 9,928,300 | \$62.86 |
| Missouri |  | 59,643 | 6,093,000 | \$9.79 |
| New York |  | 787,000 | 19,745,289 | \$39.86 |
| Ohio |  | 365,866 | 11,614,373 | \$31.50 |
| Oregon |  | 95,826 | 4,093,465 | \$23.41 |
| Rhode Island |  | 83,660 | 1,056,426 | \$79.19 |
| Washington |  | 5,890 | 7,288,000 | \$0.81 |
| West Virginia |  | 4,136 | 1,831,102 | \$2.26 |
| Average | \$ | 183,998 | 8,494,459 | \$23.07 |
| New Jersey (Proj. 2021 at maturity) | \$ | 219,800 | 8,944,469 | \$24.57 |

\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|c|c|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline \& \& \& \multicolumn{3}{|c|}{2016} \& \multicolumn{3}{|c|}{2015} \& \multicolumn{3}{|c|}{2014} \\
\hline Company \& Ticker \& Company Description \& \begin{tabular}{l}
Enterprise \\
Value (EV)
\end{tabular} \& EBITDA \& \begin{tabular}{l}
EBITDA \\
Multiples
\end{tabular} \& EV \& EBITDA \& \begin{tabular}{l}
EBITDA \\
Multiples
\end{tabular} \& EV \& EBITDA \& \begin{tabular}{l}
EBITDA \\
Multiples
\end{tabular} \\
\hline \multicolumn{12}{|c|}{\$ M USD (unless otherwise stated)} \\
\hline Boyd Gaming Corp \& BYD \& Domestic gaming facilities \& 5,804.0 \& 456.9 \& 12.7 \& 5,328.6 \& 503.8 \& 10.6 \& 4,656.1 \& 615.7 \& 7.6 \\
\hline Ceasars Entertainment Corp \& CZR \& Casino and gaming company \& 8,752.1 \& 696.0 \& 12.6 \& 8,133.1 \& 923.0 \& 8.8 \& 22,753.1 \& 1,457.0 \& 15.6 \\
\hline Las Vegas Sands Corp \& LVS \& Casino and gaming company \& 54,260.7 \& 3,600.0 \& 15.1 \& 43,618.8 \& 3,923.1 \& 11.1 \& 54,720.0 \& 5,163.9 \& 10.6 \\
\hline MGM Resorts International \& MGM \& Casino and gaming company \& 32,999.0 \& 2,900.0 \& 11.4 \& 26,510.3 \& 2,226.6 \& 11.9 \& 25,916.7 \& 2,207.3 \& 11.7 \\
\hline Penn National Gaming Inc. \& PENN \& Riverboat casino \& racing \& 6,397.3 \& 821.4 \& 7.8 \& 6,334.4 \& 812.5 \& 7.8 \& 5,731.2 \& 689.8 \& 8.3 \\
\hline Pinnacle Entertainment Inc. \& PNK \& Casino, racing \& entertainment \& 5,108.0 \& 615.2 \& 8.3 \& N/A \& 599.3 \& N/A \& N/A \& N/A \& N/A \\
\hline W ynn Resorts Ltd \& WYNN \& Casino and gaming company \& 19,706.3 \& 926.4 \& 21.3 \& 14,310.3 \& 1,069.6 \& 13.4 \& 20,523.9 \& 1,621.0 \& 12.7 \\
\hline La dbrokes Coral Group Plc \& LCL.LN \& Bookmaker \& gaming business \& \(£ 3,404.4\) \& \(£ 205.0\) \& 16.6 \& \(£ 1,482.9\) \& \(£ 213.5\) \& 6.9 \& 1,398.2 \& 203.4 \& 6.9 \\
\hline OPAPSA \& OPAP.GA \& Sportsbetting \& lottery \& € 2,824.7 \& \(€ 326.6\) \& 8.6 \& € 2,467.0 \& \(€ 376.4\) \& 6.6 \& \(€ 2,609.0\) \& \(€ 338.4\) \& 7.7 \\
\hline International Game Technology \& IGT \& Gaming Equipment and software \& 12,525.7 \& 1,500.0 \& 8.4 \& 11,295.1 \& 1,435.1 \& 7.9 \& N/A \& 1,284.5 \& N/A \\
\hline Intralot S.A. \& INLOT.GA \& On-line lottery hardware/software \& \(€ 722.8\) \& \(€ 194.8\) \& 3.7 \& € 740.9 \& \(€ 197.5\) \& 3.8 \& \(€ 654.2\) \& \(€ 175.4\) \& 3.7 \\
\hline \multirow[t]{5}{*}{Scientific Games Corp} \& \multirow[t]{5}{*}{SGMS} \& \multirow[t]{5}{*}{On-line lottery hardware/software} \& \multirow[t]{2}{*}{9,978.2} \& \multirow[t]{2}{*}{869.3

Hi} \& 11.5 \& \multirow[t]{2}{*}{8,854.2} \& 1,149.2 \& 7.7 \& \multirow[t]{2}{*}{9,224.4} \& 427.7 \& 21.6 <br>
\hline \& \& \& \& \& 21.3 \& \& Hi \& 13.4 \& \& Hi \& 21.6 <br>
\hline \& \& \& Weighted (EV) \& Average \& 13.5 \& Weighted (EV) \& V) Average \& 10.5 \& Weighted \& EV) Average \& 12.2 <br>
\hline \& \& \& \& Low \& 3.7 \& \& Low \& 3.8 \& \& Low \& 3.7 <br>
\hline \& \& \& Standard D \& Deviation \& 4.7 \& Standard \& d Deviation \& 2.8 \& Stand \& rd Deviation \& 5.1 <br>
\hline
\end{tabular}



| 7/12/2016 - announced | Berjaya Assets Bhd | Megaquest Sdn Bhd | RM 108.0 million | \$ | 27,041,800 | Malaysia |  |  |  | currency exchange as of 7/12/16 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2/8/2012 - comple ted | Codere SA | Impulsora de Centros de Entrete nimiento SA | MX 2,653,000,000 | \$ | 209,414,000 | Mexico |  |  |  | currency exchange as of 2/8/12 |
| 12/29/2011 | SNAI SpA | CogematSpA | 140,000,000 | \$ | 182,489,000 | Italy |  |  |  | currency exchange as of 12/29/11 |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { 3/25/2010 - announced } \\ & 7 / 8 / 2010 \text { - completed } \end{aligned}$ | Ontario Teachers' Pension Plan | Camelot Group plc | 389,000,000.00 | \$ | 589,366,000 | United King dom | 77,500,000.00 | \$ 95,337,400 | 6.18 | currency exchange as of $7 / 8 / 10$ EBITDA exchange as of $12 / 31 / 16$ |
| 3/2/2010 - announced <br> 4/1/2010 - completed | Tatts Group | NSW Lotteries | A\$ 845,736,000 | \$ | 774,796,000 | Australia |  |  |  | currency exchnage as on 4/1/10 |
| 8/17/2007 - completed | RexLot Fina ncial Holdings | Shenzhen Sinodata Technology Co Ltd | HK\$235,250,000 | \$ | 30,089,600 | China |  |  |  | currency exchange as of 8/17/07 |
| 12/31/2007-announced June 2008 - comple ted | RexLot Fina ncial Holdings | Shenzhen Sinodata Technology Co Ltd | HK\$600,000,000 | \$ | 76,887,100 | China |  |  |  | currency exchange as of 6/30/08 |
| 4/3/2008 - announced 4/30/2008 - closed | GTECH Corporation (Subsidiary of Lottomatica Group) | St. Enodoc Holdings Limited | 41,890,000 | \$ | 65,379,800.00 | Gibraltar |  |  |  | currency exchange rate as of 4/30/08 - confirmed in company's re port |
| 4/13/2008 - closed | RexLot Fina ncial Holdings | Guangzhou Latech Te chnology Co Ltd | RMB 80,600,000 | \$ | 11,491,100 | China |  |  |  | currency exchange rate as of 4/13/08 |
| 12/19/2007 - closed | GTECH Global Se rvices (Subsidiary of Lottomatica Group) | TIHK / CLS - GTECHCompany Ltd. | 13,900,000 | \$ | 20,016,700 | China |  |  |  | currency exchange rate as of 12/19/07 - confirme d in <br> Lottomatica's 2007 Annual Report |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { 7/19/2007 - announced } \\ & \text { 11/15/2007 - closed } \end{aligned}$ | Scientific Games Corp. | Guard Libang |  | \$ | 27,00,000 | China |  |  |  |  |
| 9/10/2007 | ChinaLot Synergy Holdings Ltd. | Guangzhou San Huan Yong Xin Tech. Ltd Co. \& Lottnal Holdings Ltd (toge the r the CMIL Group) | HK\$224,000,000 | \$ | 28,827,500 | China |  |  |  | currency exchange as of 9/10/07 |
| 5/1/2007 | Inte rna tional Game Te chnology, Inc. | ChinaLot Synergy Holdings Ltd. |  | \$ | 103,000,000 | China | -HK\$ $103,500,000$ | \$(13,232,400.00) | -7.78 | currency exchange as of 5/1/07 |
| 4/23/2007 - announced 5/14/2007 - closed | AGTech Holdings | Shining China Inc. | HK\$777,700,000 | \$ | 99,431,100 | China |  |  |  | currency exchange rate as of 5/14/07 |
| 5/1/2007-closed | Scientific Games Corp. | Oberthur Gaming Technologies |  | \$ | 102,000,000 | Canada, Australia US, France | Euro 80,900,000 (2015) | \$ 89,753,700 | 1.14 | EBITDA exchange as of 6/30/15 |
| 11/27/2006-12/22/2006 | Scientific Games Corp. | Games Media Ltd |  | \$ | 25,00,000 | United Kingdom |  |  |  |  |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { 8/13/2006 - announced } \\ & 10 / 18 / 2006 \text { - closed } \end{aligned}$ | Apax Partners Worldwide / Permira Advisers | Sisal SpA / Area Giochi Holding SpA | € 900,000,000 | \$ | 1,128,340,000 | Italy | Euro 40,800,000 (2015) | \$ 44,575,600 | 25.31 | currency exchange as of $10 / 18 / 06$ EBITDA exchange as of $12 / 31 / 2015$ |
| 8/29/2006 - closed | Lottomatica (nowIGT) | GTECH | ¢ 3,262,631,000 | \$ | 4,172,020,000 | Italy |  |  |  | curre ncy exchnage as of 8/29/06 |
| 1/16/2006-6/30/2006 | ChinaLot Synergy Holdings Ltd. | Corich International Ltd. | HK\$980,000,000 | \$ | 126,396,000 | China |  |  |  | curre ncy exchange as of 1/16/06 |
| 1/23/2006-4/20/2006 | Scientific Games Corp. | Global Draw Ltd. |  | \$ | 183,000,000 | United Kingdom |  |  | 3.55 | M\&A info <br> TV:EBITDA found on bloomberg |
| 1/20/2006-3/22/2006 | Scientific Games Corp. | Ess Net AB / Online Lottery Assets |  | \$ | 59,880,000 | Europe, Australia |  |  |  |  |
| 8/1/2003 | Lottomatica (nowIGT) | Totobit Informatica Software ESistemi SpA | $\epsilon \quad 39,000,000$ | \$ | 48,952,800 | Italy |  |  |  | currency exchange as of $12 / 31 / 03$ |
| 2/26/2002 | Scientific Games Corp. | MDI Ente era inment |  | \$ | 18,500,000 | US |  |  |  | not sure if deal actually happened?? |
| 9/18/2001 | Lottomatica (nowIGT) | Global Bingo Corporation, S.A. | 42,100,000 | \$ | 38,929,900 | Spain |  |  |  | curre ncy exchange as of 9/18/2001 |



EXHIBIT F - "BETA" VALUES

| Public Company | Ticker | Description | Country | Market Cap (US Bn) | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Market Cap } \\ & \text { (Fgn. Bn) } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | Fgn. Cur. | Beta | Beta Compared | Weighted Beta |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Boyd Gaming Corp. | BYD | Domestic gaming facilities | US | 2.77 |  |  | 1.34 | SPX | 3.71 |
| Caesars Acquisition Co. | CACQ | Equity investment in Caesars | US | 2.40 |  |  | 1.83 | SPX | 4.39 |
| Caesars Entertainment Corp. | CZR | Casino and gaming company | US | 1.62 |  |  | 1.37 | SPX | 2.22 |
| Las Vegas Sands | LVS | Casino and gaming company | US | 45.32 |  |  | 1.08 | SPX | 48.95 |
| MGM Resorts International | MGM | Casino and gaming company | US | 17.47 |  |  | 1.19 | SPX | 20.79 |
| Penn National Gaming | PENN | Riverboat casino \& racing | US | 1.70 |  |  | 1.06 | SPX | 1.80 |
| Pinnacle Entertainment Inc. | PNK | Casino, racing \& entertainment | US | 1.18 |  |  | -- |  |  |
| Wynn Resorts | WYNN | Casino and gaming company | US | 12.30 |  |  | 1.40 | SPX | 17.22 |
| Crown Resorts | CWN.AU | Casino and gaming company | Aus. | 6.72 | 9.07 | AUD | 0.93 | AS51 | 6.25 |
| Star Entertainment Group | SGR.AU | Casino and gaming company | Aus. | 3.21 | 4.34 | AUD | 0.78 | AS51 | 2.51 |
| Sands China Ltd. | 1928.HK | Casino and gaming company | Macau | 35.69 | 277.69 | HKD | 1.08 | HSI | 38.55 |
| Galaxy Entertainment Group | 27.HK | Casino and gaming company | Macau | 21.97 | 170.89 | HKD | 1.28 | HSI | 28.12 |
| SJM Holdings Ltd | 880.HK | Amusement and recreation | Macau | 5.11 | 39.77 | HKD | 1.05 | HSI | 5.37 |
| Wynn Macau Ltd | 1128.HK | Casino and gaming company | Macau | 10.63 | 82.71 | HKD | 1.30 | HSI | 13.82 |
| Ladbrokes Coral Group PLC | LCL.LN | Bookmaker \& gaming business | UK | 3.10 | 2.39 | GBP | 0.72 | UKX | 2.23 |
| OPAP SA | OPAP.GA | Sportsbetting \& lottery | Greece | 3.20 | 2.94 | EUR | 0.83 | FTASE | 2.65 |
| International Game Technology | IGT | Gaming Equipment and software | US | 4.36 | 4.36 |  | 1.24 | SPX | 5.41 |
| Intralot S.A. | INLOT.GA | On-line lottery hardware/software | Greece | 0.21 | 0.19 | EUR | 0.57 | FTASE | 0.12 |
| Scientific Games Corp. | SGMS | On-line lottery hardware/software | US | 2.00 | 2.00 |  | 2.41 | SPX | 4.82 |
| Weighted Avg. Beta |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.16 |

Source: Bloomberg

EXHIBIT G - RATE OF RETURN (RETURN ON ASSETS)

| Public Company | Ticker | Description | Country | Market Cap (US Bn) | Market Cap <br> (Fgn. Bn) | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Fgn. } \\ & \text { Cur. } \end{aligned}$ | Return on Assets | Weighted ROA |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Boyd Gaming Corp. | BYD | Domestic gaming facilities | US | 2.77 |  |  | 9.3\% | 25.76\% |
| Caesars Acquisition Co. | CACQ | Equity investment in Caesars | US | 2.40 |  |  | 41.8\% | 100.32\% |
| Caesars Entertainment Corp. | CZR | Casino and gaming company | US | 1.62 |  |  | -28.3\% | -45.85\% |
| Las Vegas Sands | LVS | Casino and gaming company | US | 45.32 |  |  | 9.1\% | 412.41\% |
| MGM Resorts International | MGM | Casino and gaming company | US | 17.47 |  |  | 4.6\% | 80.36\% |
| Penn National Gaming | PENN | Riverboat casino \& racing | US | 1.70 |  |  | 1.8\% | 3.06\% |
| Pinnacle Entertainment Inc. | PNK | Casino, racing \& entertainment | US | 1.18 |  |  | -11.0\% | -12.98\% |
| Wynn Resorts | WYNN | Casino and gaming company | US | 12.30 |  |  | 2.4\% | 29.52\% |
| Crown Resorts | CWN.AU | Casino and gaming company | Aus. | 6.72 | 9.07 | AUD | 12.1\% | 81.29\% |
| Star Entertainment Group | SGR.AU | Casino and gaming company | Aus. | 3.21 | 4.34 | AUD | 5.9\% | 18.97\% |
| Sands China Ltd. | 1928.HK | Casino and gaming company | Macau | 35.69 | 277.69 | HKD | 11.2\% | 399.76\% |
| Galaxy Entertainment Group | 27.HK | Casino and gaming company | Macau | 21.97 | 170.89 | HKD | 10.3\% | 226.24\% |
| SJM Holdings Ltd | 880.HK | Amusement and recreation | Macau | 5.11 | 39.77 | HKD | 6.2\% | 31.69\% |
| Wynn Macau Ltd | 1128.HK | Casino and gaming company | Macau | 10.63 | 82.71 | HKD | 3.4\% | 36.15\% |
| Ladbrokes Coral Group PLC | LCL.LN | Bookmaker \& gaming business | UK | 3.10 | 2.39 | GBP | -9.0\% | -27.94\% |
| OPAP SA | OPAP.GA | Sportsbetting \& lottery | Greece | 3.20 | 2.94 | EUR | 9.8\% | 31.32\% |
| International Game Technology | IGT | Gaming Equipment and software | US | 4.36 | 4.36 |  | 1.4\% | 6.10\% |
| Intralot S.A. | INLOT.GA | On-line lottery hardware/software | Greece | 0.21 | 0.19 | EUR | 0.1\% | 0.02\% |
| Scientific Games Corp. | SGMS | On-line lottery hardware/software | US | 2.00 | 2.00 |  | -4.9\% | -9.80\% |
| Weighted Return on Assets 7.66\% <br> Less Risk Free Rate $-3.05 \%$ <br> Risk Premium $4.61 \%$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Source: Bloomberg

## EXHIBIT H - DISCOUNTED CASH FLOW CALCULATION


$\begin{array}{lllllll}480,963,244 & 335,177,455 & 243,715,111 & 1777210,42 & 166,268,733 & 156,002,599\end{array}$


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Under the Draft Contribution Act, the term "Lottery Enterprise" is essentially defined as the New Jersey State Lottery, with all of its assets presently existing or acquired in the future, useful or necessary to operate the State Lottery (including the expectation to produce net proceeds for the benefit of the Retirement Systems) and liabilities related to the foregoing, on or prior to a proposed contribution in 2017 (exclusive of "Retained Liabilities" and "Retained Assets").

[^1]:    ${ }^{2}$ There are further provisions in the Northstar Service Contract limiting or "capping" the net Incentive Compensation payment that may be due from or paid to Northstar. Reference is made to the actual Northstar Service Contract for a complete discussion of the mechanics of the calculation of Incentive Compensation.

[^2]:    ${ }^{3}$ Total enterprise value defined as market capitalization less cash \& cash equivalents plus preferred stock plus total debt. ${ }^{4}$ EBITDA defined as earnings before interest, tax, depreciation and amortization.

[^3]:    ${ }^{5}$ Linearly interpolated difference means the difference between the $10-$ Year T Bond yield and the 30 -Year T-Bond yield divided by twenty (20) to derive an annual yield differential to apply for consideration of the duration difference.

